

## *Special Report*

### **A Jury of Your Peers?**

#### **An Investigation into the CoB Advisory Committee's Role in the Grievance Process**

This report takes a look at the CoB Advisory Committee's role in the Faculty Grievance process. This subject has sparked interest in usmpride.com readers since the filing of two separate Grievances in recent weeks – one by professors Marc DePree and Tom Lindley, and another by professor Franklin Mixon. Both of these Grievances were initiated against the actions of EFIB Chair George Carter, and the details of both are available at usmpride.com.

In the Mixon Grievance, the CAC met and voted unanimously against Mixon's Grievance (see documents at usmpride.com). Among the members of the CAC (from the traditional business disciplines) for the 2006-07 academic year, those participating in the Mixon hearing were:

Stephen Bushardt	Professor of Management
Jim Henderson	Professor of Accounting
Tony Henthorne	Professor of Marketing
Chang-Tseh Hsieh	Professor of MIS
Elizabeth LaFleur	Professor of Marketing

As has become customary during CoB Dean Harold Doty's Deanship, the Department of Management and Marketing – Doty's home department – dominates this group in terms of representation (60%) much like it does others.

Investigators at usmpride.com examined the research credentials of this group, using the data available on A- and B-level journal publications from a spreadsheet available on this website. The title of that document is as follows:

#### **CoB Research Productivity, 2000-Present, All Faculty, Journals Only<sup>1</sup>, Quality Adjusted<sup>2</sup>**

Data included in the table of that report are presented below, for the CAC members listed above:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Rank</u>	<u>Dept</u>	<u>Prem</u>	<u>A</u>	<u>B</u>
Henthorne	Full	MKT			2
LaFleur	Full	MKT			1
Bushardt	Full	MGT			
Hsieh	Full	MIS			

Jim Henderson's name is not listed in the Research Productivity document referenced above. However, sources indicate that Henderson's journal publication record over the

2000-present period contains no entries in the A- or B-level categories. Thus, over a 6.5 year period, three CAC members (Bushardt, Henderson, Hsieh) appear to have produced no A- or B-level publications, while LaFleur published only a single B-level journal article over the same 6.5 year period. The remaining individual, CAC Chair Henthorne, published two B-level articles from 2000-present. In total, these **five** CoB faculty (CAC members) published a total of only **three** B-level journal articles over the 6.5 year period, 2000-present.

Issue 2 of usmpride.com’s new series, *The CoB Admin & “The CoB Mob,”* examined the 2006 merit raises of economics professors Franklin Mixon and Charles Sawyer. The title of that report is shown below:

*The CoB Admin & “The CoB Mob”*

**A Look at the 2006 Merit Raises**

A table included in the report above provided a synopsis of Mixon’s and Sawyer’s research productivity (using A-level journals) over the period 2003-05, or the evaluation period used in the CoB management team meeting in spring of 2006 to evaluate faculty for merit raises. That table is inserted below:

**Table 1**  
**Research Production: Sawyer and Mixon**

<u>Name</u>	<u>Year</u>	<u>A-Level Journals</u>
Sawyer, Charles	2005	0
	2004	0
	2003	0
Mixon, Franklin	2005	3
	2004	2
	2003	2

As the table above shows, Mixon published **seven** A-level articles over the **three** years from 2003-05. Thus, Mixon published **more than twice as many A-level publications** in the **three** years from 2003-05 as the **total number of A- and B-level publications** by the **five CAC members** over the **6.5 year period** from 2000-present.

Next, investigators examined the spring 2007 teaching schedules of the five CAC members listed above. That information is presented below:

<b>Name</b>	<b>Spring 2007 Course Load</b>
Bushardt, S.	MGT 454 (1-2:15, Tu/Th); MBA 645 (6:30-9:15, Tu); MBA 645 (6:30-9:15, Th) <b>Onerous Score: 3</b>
Henderson, J.	ACC 325 (8-9:15, Tu/Th); ACC 325 (11-12:15, Tu/Th); ACC 660 (2:25-3:40, Tu/Th) <b>Onerous Score: 1</b>
Henthorne, T.	MKT 365 (1-2:15, Tu/Th); MKT 495/595 (6:30-9:15, Tu); MKT 495 (6:30-9:15, W) <b>Onerous Score: 3</b>
Hsieh, C.	MIS 310 (2:25-3:40, Tu/Th); MIS 476 (6:30-9:15, W) <b>Onerous Score: 2</b>
LaFleur, E.	MKT 300 (6:30-9:15, W); MKT 300 (3:50-6:25, Tu); MKT 444 (3:50-6:25, Th) <b>Onerous Score: 2</b>

Note that the table above includes each of the five CAC faculty's **Onerous Score**, using the methodology developed in Mixon's Grievance that quantifies the number of onerous aspects of one's teaching load, with a maximum score of 6. As shown above, Henderson's schedule exhibits only **1** of the six onerous factors. Hsieh and LaFleur have schedules that exhibit **2** of the onerous characteristics, while Bushardt and Henthorne have spring 2007 schedules that exhibit **3** of the six onerous factors. Recall that Mixon's schedule for spring 2007 exhibits all **6** of the six onerous factors.

As in Mixon's Grievance document, we calculated the difference between each of the six onerous scores and the mean score of 2.83, as shown below (t-stats):

<b>Name</b>	<b>#Onerous</b>	<b># Minus Mean</b>
Henderson, J.	1	-1.83 (-2.61)
Hsieh, C.	2	-0.83 (-1.19)
LaFleur, E.	2	-0.83 (-1.19)
Bushardt, S.	3	0.17 (0.24)
Henthorne, T.	3	0.17 (0.24)
Mixon, F.	6	3.17 (4.53)

As the table above shows, Hsieh, LaFleur, Bushardt, and Henthorne have individual scores that are not statistically different than the mean (2.83). Henderson has a spring

2007 teaching schedule that is statistically better than the mean, while Mixon has a teaching schedule that is twice as onerous as the mean teaching schedule of the group. Thus, Mixon's jury does not resemble him in any way in terms of either research productivity or teaching load difficulty.

### **Additional Commentary**

This *Special Report* provides another example of how upside down things in the CoB are under Harold Doty's leadership. Accounting professor Jim Henderson is another one of the CoB's poster boys for a 4/4 teaching load, yet he has arguably the best spring 2007 teaching schedule of the six faculty that are examined in this report. This is so even though Henderson's research is the weakest among the group. That he earns \$112,360 each 9-month academic year only muddles things even more.

Mixon's Grievance refers to statements about Stephen Bushardt and Elizabeth LaFleur that were made by EFIB Chair George Carter. Apparently, Carter believes these two to be masterful manipulators of people. They may be serving Doty in this and other CoB schemes. Henthorne has also historically been a friend to CoB administrators.

On a final note, there is a document circulating around the CoB that shows the teaching loads for spring 2007 for all CoB faculty. Mixon's is by far the worst on the entire list. Investigators at usmpride.com are in possession of that spreadsheet, and will make it available in the coming days.